

Migration Advisory Committee

Economic and social impacts of the UK's exit from the European Union and how the UK's immigration system should be aligned with a modern industrial strategy

Evidence of the Association of School and College Leaders

A Introduction

- 1 The Association of School and College Leaders (ASCL) represents nearly 19,000 education system leaders, heads, principals, deputies, vice-principals, assistant heads, business managers and other senior staff of state-funded and independent schools and colleges throughout the UK. ASCL members are responsible for the education of more than four million young people in more than 90 per cent of the secondary and tertiary phases, and in an increasing proportion of the primary phase. This places the association in a strong position to consider this issue from the viewpoint of the leaders of schools and colleges of all types.
- 2 ASCL submitted evidence to the Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) on the 'Partial review of the shortage occupation list' on 12 September 2017. The evidence submitted at that time is still highly relevant and ASCL is grateful for the opportunity to be able to add to our evidence as part of this review.
- 3 Our remarks are organised in sections as follows:
 - A Introduction**
 - B General comments**
 - C EEA migration trends**
 - D Recruitment practices, training and skills**
 - E Economic, social and fiscal impacts**
 - F Conclusion and recommendations**

B General Comments

- 4 ASCL has for some years been warning of an impending crisis in teacher recruitment and retention, a crisis which has now arrived. ASCL documents that make this case include an ASCL survey of school leaders (January 2015)¹, a ten-point plan to tackle the problem (April 2015)², our submission to the Education Select Committee Inquiry into the Supply of Teachers (November 2015)³, an ASCL survey of school leaders (January 2016)⁴, and our submission to the Public Accounts Committee Inquiry into the Training of New Teachers (February 2016)⁵.

¹ See www.ascl.org.uk/news-and-views/news_news-detail.ascl-survey-reveals-scale-of-growing-teacher-recruitment-crisis.html

² See www.ascl.org.uk/help-and-advice/help-and-advice.10-point-plan-to-tackle-recruitment-crisis.html

³ See www.ascl.org.uk/utilities/document-summary.html?id=45DC7F27-65AB-4188-81AAE71A59B5A6F

⁴ See www.ascl.org.uk/news-and-views/news_news-detail.survey-shows-damage-of-teacher-shortages.html and the appendix.

⁵ See www.ascl.org.uk/policy/consultation-responses_news-detail.training-new-teachers.html

- 5 The ASCL position is borne out by reports of the National Audit Office (NAO) (February 2016)⁶ and the Public Accounts Committee (June 2016)⁷, which essentially agree that there is a problem of recruitment of teachers (and to the extent examined, a problem of retention too). The ASCL view was further supported by the Education Select Committee Report: Retention and Recruitment of Teachers (February 2017)⁸
- 6 The Department for Education was slow to accept that there was an issue of teacher supply and retention, however this issue is now well recognised as critical. As noted in the NAO report, most targets for secondary teacher recruitment have been missed for a number of years.
- 7 As indicated in our previous submission to MAC, ASCL considers the methodology used by the DfE to set targets for the training of new teachers to be severely flawed and it has failed to produce a plan that would ensure an adequate supply of new teachers.
- 8 The January 2016 ASCL survey of school leaders included in our previous submission indicated that the overwhelming majority of schools are having difficulty recruiting teachers and that the situation was worsening.
- 9 The shortage of teachers, particularly in secondary schools, is likely to worsen significantly in the near future due to demographic changes. A sizable increase in secondary school population is expected over the next few years as larger age-cohorts now in the primary phase move through. The most recent figures available from the DfE (July 2017)⁹ show the predicated rise in pupil numbers.

Year	Maintained nursery and state-funded primary schools	State-funded secondary schools	State-funded special schools	Alternative provision settings	Total state-funded schools
2017	4,583	2,797	95	15	7,490
2018	4,638	2,863	98	15	7,614
2019	4,662	2,953	101	16	7,731
2020	4,661	3,046	103	17	7,826
2021	4,669	3,117	104	17	7,907
2022	4,671	3,188	106	18	7,982
2023	4,665	3,257	107	18	8,047
2024	4,650	3,317	108	18	8,093
2025	4,660	3,330	108	19	8,116
2026	4,685	3,331	108	19	8,144

Pupil numbers are in 1000s

⁶ See www.nao.org.uk/report/training-new-teachers/

⁷ See [www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201617/cmselect/cmpubacc/73/73.pdf](https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201617/cmselect/cmpubacc/73/73.pdf)

⁸ See <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201617/cmselect/cmeduc/199/19902.htm>

⁹ See <https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/national-pupil-projections-july-2017>

- 10 It is clear that for the next nine years at least the number of children arriving in secondary schools will increase, and the simple calculation shows the secondary population growing each year to a total in 2026 19% higher than at present. To maintain standards the number of secondary teachers also needs to grow by a similar percentage over that period.
- 11 There is movement between the state and independent sectors that complicates the picture above, but a similar calculation based on the numbers enrolled in all types of school would suggest an even greater growth in secondary numbers.
- 12 It is clearly much harder to predict with certainty the number of primary places needed, but the DfE's own numbers predict a growth of just over 100,000 in the same nine year period and this will mean an increased demand for primary teachers.
- 13 Likewise, the numbers in post-16 education in schools is harder to predict accurately, as approximately half of the age-16 cohort leave school for education or training in colleges or apprenticeships. However, the predicted increase in secondary school numbers will increase the size of each post-16 cohort leading to an increased requirement for teachers in both the 16-19 school and college sectors.
- 14 A recent change of government policy has been to require all 16 and 17 year old students in schools and colleges who have not obtained a grade C in English or maths to re-sit the relevant subject. This has created a further demand for teachers of these subjects felt most strongly in colleges but also in school sixth forms.
- 15 It is clear from the ASCL surveys that the shortage of teachers is national, not limited to certain regions. As would be expected the situation is worse in some areas than others but the ASCL regional conferences in autumn 2016 made it clear that there is a problem in all regions of England and Wales¹⁰.
- 16 The shortage of teachers is not limited to a few subject-specialisms as in the past. The ASCL survey of January 2016¹¹ asked about the subjects found to be difficult. As might be expected the existing shortage subjects of maths and science head the list, but they are now joined by significant numbers of schools having problems recruiting teachers of English, modern foreign languages (MFL), geography, history and other subjects. A frequently heard response to this question when asked of school leaders directly is "it is easier to list subjects that are not difficult to recruit".
- 17 The decision that the UK should leave the EU is likely to worsen the teacher shortage, as a number of teachers in British schools are nationals of other EU countries. Some of these teachers may well leave Britain, and it will be harder to recruit replacements from the same sources.
- 18 This issue will have an effect on all subjects, but will probably be most noted in MFL. The languages taught most widely in our schools are French, German and Spanish, and a proportion of their teachers are native-speakers recruited from the relevant EU nations. In the ASCL survey MFL is already the fourth most mentioned subject area for

¹⁰Each autumn, ASCL holds regional information conferences throughout England, and a national conference in Wales, these are well attended by school leaders. In 2016 each was asked a number of questions about teacher recruitment via an electronic scoring system. Though there were variations, there was consistent report of difficult and worsening recruitment. ASCL can supply exact figures if they would be helpful.

¹¹See www.ascl.org.uk/news-and-views/news_news-detail.survey-shows-damage-of-teacher-shortages.html

difficulty of recruitment, and there is an urgent need to increase the number of children studying foreign languages. This is recognised by the government and there is a drive to increase the learning of Mandarin Chinese in particular, for which it is particularly hard to recruit teachers already resident in Britain.

- 19 A further problem for future supply of teachers of MFL is that there has been a marked decline in the number of young people taking languages at 'A' level¹². This is likely to lead to fewer students taking language degrees and hence fewer training to be teachers.
- 20 There is also an identified shortage of teachers qualified to teach in special schools and the current workforce includes many teachers from the EEA who, if suitably qualified from their own country of origin, are automatically allowed to teach in special education in the UK but not in mainstream.
- 21 The shortage of teachers is having an effect on the quality of the education that our young people receive. The ASCL survey of January 2016 indicates this clearly, with a large majority of respondents indicating that recruitment difficulties are having a detrimental effect.
- 22 As indicated in our previous submission a number of factors largely hide the problem from the DfE, as its survey simply asks for vacancies on a date in November, by which time arrangements (whether satisfactory or not) will have been made. But even these figures are rising, as you have noted, as vacancy rates in England across most subjects have increased. This has also been reflected in increased numbers of Tier 2 applications, as noted in your previous consultation document.
- 23 It is a matter of great importance to the nation that it should have an education system of the highest quality. That is not disputed and is the stated aim of government. But that cannot be achieved without a sufficient number of well-trained and dedicated teachers. The problem needs to be addressed and the recruitment of teachers from EEA countries is an important strand of the solution.

C EEA migration trends

- 24 The notes above refer specifically to teaching posts however EEA migrant workers fulfil a range of other roles either directly employed by their school, local authority or by contractors working for the school. The other roles they carry out include:
 - Teaching Assistants
 - Administrative and clerical staff
 - IT, laboratory and technology technicians
 - Building and grounds maintenance staff
 - Caretaking and cleaning staff
- 25 The European Economic Area (EEA) provides for the free movement of persons, goods, services and capital within the internal market of the European Union (EU)

¹² See The British Council publication *Language Trends 2016/16* pages 32-43
www.britishcouncil.org/education/schools/support-for-languages/thought-leadership/research-report/language-trends-2015-16

between its 28 member states, as well as three of the four member states (Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway) of the European Free Trade Association (EFTA). Switzerland is also included in the free movement directive for professional recognition.

- 26 Outside of these groups experienced teachers from overseas are currently allowed to teach unqualified in maintained schools for a 4-year period of grace while they achieve QTS by another route.
- 27 EEA nationals make up a significant proportion of the teaching workforce. There were 4,795 QTS awards made to qualified teachers from the EEA in financial year 2015 to 2016 (latest available data). This represents a 10% increase from financial year 2014 to 2015, where the number of QTS awards was 4,351.
- 28 The EEA countries of origin with more than 10 per cent of the total number of QTS awards made to EEA countries in financial year 2015 to 2016 were:
- Spain - 1,977 QTS awards (4 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015)
 - Greece - 572 QTS awards (46 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015)
 - Poland - 545 QTS awards (6 per cent decrease from financial year 2014 to 2015)

The number of fully qualified teachers from each EEA country awarded QTS is available in Table 8 of the SFR 57/2016, 24 November 2016: Initial Teacher Training census for the academic year 2016 to 2017, England¹³.

- 29 It is recognised that migrants from outside the EEA also contribute to the teaching workforce. The number of QTS awards made to teachers from outside the EEA (Australia, Canada, New Zealand and the USA) was 2,031 in financial year 2015 to 2016. This is a 27 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015, where the number of QTS awards was 1,598. These 2,031 QTS awards are distributed between the non-EEA countries as follows:
- Canada – 765 QTS awards (25 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015)
 - Australia – 639 QTS awards (22 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015)
 - USA – 379 QTS awards (51 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015)
 - New Zealand – 248 QTS awards (16 per cent increase from financial year 2014 to 2015)
- 30 There is no difference between the jobs that EEA workers carry out in schools and colleges than those done by UK and non-EEA workers, although it is noticeable that there are a number of EEA workers fulfilling low paid manual employment e.g.

¹³See https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/572290/ITT_Census_1617_SFR_Final.pdf

cleaning, catering assistants. Many of these workers are employed by agencies or contractors

- 31 The data in paragraphs 27 and 28 above indicates an increase in EEA workers coming into teaching.
- 32 Although we do not have data on the number of other workers employed in schools and colleges anecdotal evidence from our members indicates that this was also increasing.
- 33 The outcome of the EU referendum has had an impact on existing migrant workers. Evidence from our members would indicate that they feel less secure of their future working in the UK. Indeed we hear of EEA migrant workers who have already left their posts to work in other countries. One member quoted losing their Head of Languages, a French national, who went back to teach in mainland Europe together with his wife, a Spanish national, who was teaching in a different school. Another reported losing two Slovenian maths teachers who also went to teach in another European country because of uncertainty of their future in the UK.
- 34 ASCL members report that some EEA and other non-UK teachers have felt uncomfortable with the attitude of some UK residents towards them following the outcome of the EU referendum.
- 35 The figures given in paragraphs 27 and 28 above give a clear indication of the potential impact on the teaching workforce should there be any reduction in EEA migration. Indeed the data given in paragraph 9 clearly indicates that there will be an increased requirement for teachers over the next nine years which would suggest there needs to be an increase in EEA migration of people able to qualify as teachers.
- 36 Although we do not have access to data to support our anecdotal evidence members indicate that a reduction in EEA migrant workers willing to work in low paid manual jobs would also have an impact on our school and college workforce.
- 37 The data in paragraph 29 indicates that there would be a significant impact on the ability of schools to staff their schools with teachers if there was a reduction in the migration of non-EEA migrants.
- 38 The effect of a reduction in non-EEA migrants on the ability of schools to be fully staffed with non-teaching staff and the impact on contractors is less clear as data on employment in these roles is not readily available to us.

D Recruitment practices, training and skills

- 39 Many schools and colleges recruit teachers directly from EEA countries or use agency staff also recruited from EEA and non-EEA countries. In general there is no significant difference in the recruitment methods used for UK, EEA and non-EEA workers.
- 40 It is worth noting that a search of the Tier 2 and 5 sponsor register¹⁴ indicates that

¹⁴https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/653829/2017_10_23_tier_2_5_register_of_sponsors.pdf

there are over 1,000 institutions with 'school' or 'academy' in their title registered as sponsors. This demonstrates that many schools already are looking beyond the UK to recruit suitably qualified staff. This would indicate that once the UK leaves the EU, and in the absence of appropriate arrangements, a significant gap will be left if those positions currently filled by EEA workers become vacant.

- 41 The briefing note accompanying the call for evidence notes sponsorship and/or work permits as one option for dealing with EEA nationals coming to work in the UK post-exit from the EU. Although some schools have Tier 2 and 5 sponsor status, the vast majority will be completely unfamiliar with what sponsorship entails. Many will also struggle with the costs associated with having a sponsor licence and the associated compliance burden. Recruitment costs are already significant without the extra cost of being a sponsor. In addition salary thresholds in Tier 2 are already problematic for the school and college sectors.
- 42 A number of schools, particularly when they work as a MAT or federation, hold recruitment events abroad. Similar processes operate in both EEA and non-EEA countries. It is also fairly regular practice for interview and selection processes to be carried out remotely for both EEA and non-EEA teachers.
- 43 There are no indications that these selection processes have changed since the EU referendum. There is however anecdotal evidence that applicants are less sure of the commitment of the UK to enable them to work in the UK and seek some reassurance as to their medium term employment prospects.
- 44 As the education system in the UK has differences from those in EEA countries most schools employing teachers directly from EEA countries will have some form of enhanced induction programme to fully prepare them for their teaching role in UK schools.
- 45 Additional training is not usually required for EEA nationals that complete their initial teacher training through the UK system.
- 46 There are many advantages in employing workers from EEA, and non-EEA, countries as they demonstrate to young people the global nature of the world in which they will grow up and live. The presence of such workers enhances the multi-cultural nature of the curriculum.
- 47 Teachers from specific countries bring a range of different skills to the teaching workforce. This goes beyond the obvious advantage of having native speakers teaching foreign languages and includes using maths teachers from EEA countries where maths is a strong subject, helping to address the shortfall in maths teachers in the UK.

E Economic, social and fiscal impacts

- 48 The provision of high quality education to all young people will be critical for the long term economic well-being of the country. It is therefore essential that the nation's schools and colleges are fully staffed by high quality teachers. Given the current shortfall in teacher numbers and the projected increase in student numbers there is a significant risk to the quality of education that will be available to young people.

- 49 Schools and colleges work hard within their communities to promote social cohesion. However the impact of the outcome of the EU referendum has had social implications in terms of the attitudes in some communities to migrants from EEA and non-EEA countries.
- 50 There are financial implications for schools and colleges whenever there is a shortage of available staff. This is already noticeable in the current teacher shortage as schools and colleges have to increase financial recruitment and retention incentives for teachers and/or pay high fees to agencies in ‘finder’s fees’ or supply teacher rates. As school budgets are constrained this has an impact on the number of teachers schools are able to employ which has implications on the curriculum and other educational opportunities available to young people.
- 51 School funding levels are already at crisis point which will at some stage mean the government will need to find additional funds to meet the needs of schools and colleges.

F Conclusion and recommendation

- 52 The teacher shortage situation was highlighted as recently as September 2017 in the National Audit Office report ‘Retaining and developing the teaching workforce’¹⁵. Teaching is a skilled profession. There is a marked and growing shortage of suitable applicants for teaching posts, not limited to particular regions or any longer to particular specialisms. This is having a detrimental effect on the education service, which will make government education policy hard to achieve and will ultimately damage the national economy. Solutions to the problem are not yet in hand and would take several years at best to address it. Short term solutions aimed at improving domestic recruitment are not available.
- 53 ASCL would therefore recommend that actions are taken to ensure that the migration of teachers from EEA and non-EEA countries is permitted to help address the current shortfall in the UK.
- 54 The position for the migration of those likely to be employed in non-teaching positions in schools is less clear given the shortage of detailed information. ASCL would therefore recommend that a detailed study of the relevant data, specific to schools and colleges, is made before any decisions are made and that a further consultation is held before finalising any decisions related to the migration of people who may be employed in schools and colleges in these roles.
- 55 I hope that this is of value to your review, ASCL is willing to be further consulted and to assist in any way that it can.

Malcolm Trobe CBE
Director of Public Affairs
Association of School and College Leaders
25 October 2017

¹⁵See <https://www.nao.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/Retaining-and-developing-the-teaching-workforce.pdf>